

18/1993/FUL - Appendix 1

Cambridge City Council

Design & Conservation Panel

Notes of the meeting Wednesday 10th October 2018

Attendees:

David Grech	formerly Historic England, co-opted member (Vice Chair)
Russell Davies	RTPI
Jon Harris	Architectural historian, draughtsman, co-opted member
Ian Steen	Retired architect, co-opted member
Zoe Skelding	RIBA
Robert Myers	Landscape Institute (Item 1 only)
Stacey Weiser	Cambridge PPF (Item 2 only)
Jo Morrison	Landscape Institute (Item 2 only)

Officers:

Christian Brady	City Council
Mairead O'Sullivan	City Council (item 2)

Observers:

Cllr Martin Smart	City Council
-------------------	--------------

Presenters – item 2:

Hugo Marrack	Feilden Clegg Bradley Studios
Robert Myers	Robert Myers Associates
Jon Burgess	Beacon Planning
Shane Alexander	Kings College

Apologies – Di Haigh (Chair) and Tony Nix

2. Presentation – Croft Gardens, Barton Road, Cambridge.

This was first seen by the Panel in July 2016. Following the withdrawal of a planning application incorporating those proposals a revised design was presented to the Panel in July 2018 (minutes re-circulated). This second pre-application presentation focussed on the design issues raised in the previous meeting.

The Panel welcomed the serious consideration and response that had been given to the issues raised at their last review, and there was

general agreement that the scheme has benefited from these design developments. In more detail the Panel's comments were as follows:

Buildings A, B and C

While the original 'horseshoe' arrangement has been retained, the detailed design of these three buildings has been developed, including greater consideration of the entrances, detailing of the brickwork, and the introduction of a pitched roof to Building C. The treatment of the gables to Buildings A and B facing on to Barton Road has also been revised to incorporate bays to the first and second floors, and a more animated treatment facing on to the road. The Panel were supportive of all these changes.

27A Barton Road

The new building adjacent to the Edwardian house at No 29 Barton Road has been re-designed so that the communal kitchens now overlook the street and incorporate bay windows to provide a more active frontage. The Panel welcomed this development, while at the same time noting that the detailed design of this building could provide a transition between the Edwardian house and the rest of the development. The suggestion that the roof form might be revised to remove the gable onto Barton Road was thought to be worth further consideration, since the current gable 'dilutes' the impact of the twin gables on Blocks A and B. Consideration might also be given to a slate roof for this building (No 29 has a slate roof) to further differentiate it from Buildings A, B and C, whilst still retaining the feeling of a 'family' of buildings.

Landscaping

The overall concept of three gardens for all residents was welcomed, along with the detailed development of the landscaping, including the revised location for the allotments. However, the scheme might benefit from further refinement of the landscaping, including provision of a creeper or pleached tree to the blank east elevation of the retained No 27, and also to soften some of the brickwork on the new buildings.

Materials

While a number of buildings in the area are of red brickwork, the Panel supported the decision to use gault brick on this development, subject to the detailed choice of brick. The proposed 'corduroy' detailing of the brickwork to differentiate between the convex and concave elevation was again welcomed. The re-use of the best of the salvaged green glazed pantiles for the bike stores was also seen as an enhancement of

the proposals. The final material selection and detailing of the scheme will be key to the overall success of the development.

Justification for demolition

At the last meeting the Chair sought clarification on the case for demolition. Dr Jon Burgess (Beacon Planning) advised the Panel that a detailed justification in support of the demolition has now been prepared, and he outlined a brief summary of the case. While the Panel welcomed this additional information, they felt that they would need a more detailed consideration in order to comment on the merits of the case. The Panel were advised that the City Council have only just received a copy of this report, and have not had the opportunity to consider it in detail. The Panel's support of the current proposals is therefore on the assumption that the case for demolition has been adequately made, and should not be seen as prejudging that aspect of the proposal.

Conclusion:

The Panel welcomed the detailed design developments and felt that the changes made since they had last seen the proposal constituted a great improvement. Subject to the acceptance of the case for demolition, the Panel consider that these proposals have the potential to make a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the conservation area.

VERDICT – GREEN (7 – unanimous)

3. Notes of the last meeting – Wednesday 12th September 2018

Notes agreed.

4. Any Other Business

Officers, presenters and Panel members said farewell and thanks to Jon Harris for his many years of service and wished him well ahead of his move to King's Lynn.

5. Date of next meeting – Wednesday 14th November 2018

Reminder

CABE 'traffic light' definitions:

GREEN: a good scheme, or one that is acceptable subject to minor improvements

AMBER: in need of *significant* improvements to make it acceptable, but not a matter of starting from scratch

RED: the scheme is fundamentally flawed and a fresh start is needed.